

Addressing Controversial Historical Issues through the study of the Great Irish Famine

by Maureen Murphy, Maureen McCann Miletta and Alan Singer

Studying about the Great Irish Famine provides teachers and students with an opportunity to explore controversial issues in global history. Our approach in the Great Irish Famine curriculum is to emphasize the complexity of history by presenting multiple perspectives about the causes and significance of events. The Great Irish Famine Curriculum guide makes available to teachers and students a variety of primary and secondary source documents and lesson plans. Questions and activities that accompany the documents and lessons encourage students to think, write and speak as historians, to analyze historical material, to question their assumptions, to gather and organize evidence before reaching conclusions, to discover connections between events, to recognize parallel developments that may not be directly related, and to realize that conclusions are subject to change as new evidence and more integrative theories emerge. As they study about the Great Irish Famine students should come to realize that historians do not have all the answers about the past or present and that they do not always agree.

The Great Irish Famine curriculum guide gives students and teachers an opportunity to examine a number of essential social studies and historical questions that are also major components of the New York State Social Studies Learning Standards. Examples of essential questions include, a) "Are there historical or philosophical connections between Slavery and the African Slave Trade, the Great Irish Famine, and the European Holocaust, subjects that are focal points in the New York State Human Rights curriculum, but which happened in different eras?"; b) "What are the relationships between these events and broader historical developments?"; c) "What types of injustice and oppression constitute genocide?"; d) "Is there such a thing as human nature, and if so, what is it?"; e) "Why have some groups of people been victimized in the past?"; f) "How do people survive, resist, and maintain human dignity under inhumane circumstance?"; g) "Why do some people become rescuers while others collaborate with oppressors?"; h) "Should historians assign blame for historical events?"; i) "Should a focus for historians be identifying individuals or groups as villains or should it be examining the social, economic and political systems that generate human rights violations?"; j) "What criteria, if any, should be used to evaluate actions by individuals, groups, and societies?"; k) "Who should be considered citizens of a country and what rights and responsibilities should accompany citizenship?"; l) "What are the relationships between history and geography?"; and, m) "When should the cause of a catastrophe be consider an act of nature and when should it be considered the responsibility of human institutions?"

Following is a discussion of some historical controversies that can help teachers think about issues related to the Great Irish Famine before they begin to examine specific lessons and documents.

A Point of View about History

The definition of history is complicated because it refers to a series of distinct but related ideas: (a) events from the past -- "facts," (b) the process of gathering and organizing information from the past -- historical research, (c) explanations about the relationships between specific historical events, and (d) broader explanations or "theories" about how and why change takes place. In other words, history is simultaneously the past, the study of the past, explanations about the past, and explanations about human nature and the nature of society.

The pedagogy that informs the organization of the social studies lesson material in the Great Irish Famine Curriculum Guide draws on this broad understanding of history. It is not a list of facts to memorize though it tries to incorporate a considerable amount of historical information. While we believe that drawing conclusions about the past is a vital part of the historical process, we try not to make a narrow ideological presentation. We hope the material in this guide allows room for widespread debate and promotes a broad dialogue on what makes us human and what is the responsibility of society.

To achieve these goals, we are offering a document-based curriculum guide for social studies lessons that is organized to promote an inquiry approach to learning history. We want students and teachers to become historians,

to sift through the past, to examine different data and interpretations, and to draw their own conclusions based on a variety of evidence.

We also recognize that teachers play the crucial role in the creation of curriculum because they choose the material that will ultimately be presented in their classrooms. We want to facilitate, not usurp this function. Instead of dictating what should be taught, the curriculum guide offers teachers a broad range of primary source documents, interpretive passages, worksheets, literary resources, and individual and group projects.

Drawing Connections between Historical Events

Study of the Great Irish Famine is part of a New York Human Rights curriculum that includes study of Slavery in the Americas and the Atlantic Slave Trade and the World War II era European Holocaust. Part of the task confronting teachers is to help students examine potential connections and/or parallels between these historical events. This involves students in exploring theories of historical change and ideas about human nature, culture and civilization, the role of government, and the political and economic organization of societies.

A difficulty in making direct comparisons between these events is that they happened in different historical eras, had different goals, and occurred in different social and economic systems. While studying Slavery and the Atlantic Slave Trade, students need to examine and understand the magnitude and specific historical context of a system that, between 1500 and the end of the nineteenth century, enslaved millions of Africans and transported them across the Atlantic Ocean to the Americas where they and their descendants were defined as non-humans and were expected to provide unpaid labor in perpetuity. Historians have argued that this system of human exploitation played a central role in European colonial expansion around the world and that the labor of enslaved Africans was crucial to the development of commercial capitalism and the start of the industrial revolution.

On the other hand, while the social, political, and economic conditions that contributed to both the Great Irish Famine and the European Holocaust had deep historical roots, these events happened in a much narrower time frame and a more restricted locale and had different impacts on the affected peoples. The first year of the Great Irish Famine was 1845, the last failure of the potato crop was in 1849, and famine-related deaths tapered off by 1852. The famine occurred in part of the United Kingdom, the most powerful and prosperous country during the early part of the industrial era, and while Ireland suffered from a severe population decline during this period, most of it was the result of emigration rather than death.

The European Holocaust is generally studied in connection with the growth of Nazi ideology and power in Germany prior to and during World War II. It was precipitated by a culturally, technologically and industrially advanced nation that in the middle of the twentieth century sought to exterminate an entire group of people.

A problem teachers should consider when comparing these events is that historians prefer to limit the use of historical terms to specific, relatively narrow, historical contexts. These distinctions may or may not be appropriate in elementary, middle or high school social studies lessons. Examples of terms with complex and changing meanings that also have narrower technical definitions are racism and imperialism.

Racism is popularly used to define any form of prejudice or discrimination that is based on the belief that some hereditary groups are superior or inferior to others. In the United States during the era of slavery, enslaved Africans were defined as chattel, a non-human form of property, any person with a single African ancestor was considered non-white, and in the south, laws were passed to prevent manumission (the freeing of slaves). In Nazi Germany an effort was made to apply quasi-scientific notions of genetics and Social Darwinism to outlaw racial mixing between Aryans (Germans) and people who were deemed to be racially inferior, particularly Jews. In both situations, Africans and Jews were subject to severe restrictions and could not legally change their racial classification.

English observers of the Irish before and during the famine also describe the Irish as an inferior race and often argue that their inferiority was the primary reason for the devastation caused by the famine. However, the focus in these documents tends to be on the culture, religion, and work habits of the Irish, rather than their biological heredity. Some observers even suggest that if the Irish renounce their way of life and live like Englishmen, they will no longer be racially inferior. In this view of race, which is different from the ones employed in the United States during the era of slavery and in Nazi Germany, it is possible for individuals and entire groups to change their racial status. Students need to examine similarities and differences in the way the term racism is used in different settings and to decide where and when they believe it is applicable.

Imperialism generally is used to describe empire-building and the exploitation of one nation over another to obtain economic, military and political benefits. In its broadest sense, it includes colonialism, the practice of creating permanent settlements in other lands, and mercantilism, the regulation of colonial economies to benefit the dominant power. It has also been used to describe the relationship between a dominant group that holds political power in a country and ethnic minorities that are subject to their power. Using this general definition, the term imperialism can be used to describe the historic relationship between England and Ireland.

Historians, however, tend to differentiate between forms of national domination, especially during different historical periods. The term imperialism and the designation "Age of Imperialism," are often reserved for describing the expansion of European influence in Africa and Asia as European nationalism and the needs of industrial economies spurred competition for markets and raw materials between 1870 and the start of World War I. need to consider whether making this type of distinction will be meaningful for their students, and if so, how best to address it.

Addressing the Political Debate

The meaning of the Great Irish Famine has been contested by political activists and historians from the 1850s to the present day. The Great Irish Famine has been the source of nationalist anger, a historical problem to be coolly dissected and demythologized, and a reminder of the realities of hunger and poverty in the modern world. Mary Robinson, the former President of the Republic of Ireland argues that reflection on the Great Irish Famine should spur action to prevent similar catastrophes in the present and future. We hope the Great Irish Famine Curriculum Guide will promote discussion about access to food and health care as human rights, and an examination of the responsibility of governments to meet the needs of people in modern, democratic, industrial and post-industrial societies, topics that are fundamental parts of the New York State Social Studies Standards and the Economics and Participation in Government curricula.

A highly contentious political debate is over whether or not the government of Great Britain consciously pursued genocidal policies designed to depopulate Ireland through death and emigration. While we do not believe that British policies during the Great Irish Famine meet the criteria for genocide established by the United Nations (1951) in a treaty signed by the United States, we believe it is a legitimate subject for discussion.

One way to approach the political debates is to explore the differences between the goals of political activists and historians. The primary concern of activists is to win support for their political position in an effort to bring about political, social and economic changes in society. While historians also have political views and goals, their professional commitment requires that they examine events from multiple perspectives and that they hold themselves to a higher standard when they draw conclusions based on evidence. As students read excerpts from primary source documents and interpretations of the causes of the Great Irish Famine and the reasons for British policies, they need to consider the following questions: a) "Is this commentator writing as a political activist or an historian?"; b) "What is her/his point of view about the Great Irish Famine and other events in Irish history?"; c) "Does her/his point of view aid in their examination of events or interfere with their analysis?"; d) "How could the argument be made more effective?"; and e) "Can someone be impartial when researching and writing about a topic like the Great Irish Famine?"

The authors of the Great Irish Famine Curriculum acknowledge that we have individual, and a collective, points of view, and we recognize that our views influence our interpretations of famine history, and the way we selected documents, organized lessons, and framed questions. In general, we believe the Great Irish Famine was the result of multiple causes, including a natural ecological disaster, rapid population growth, religious and cultural prejudice, a British imperial ideology that legitimized colonialism, government relief programs that were inadequate to the magnitude of need, and policies that favored English political and economic interests, especially the interests of emerging English industrial capitalism. To limit the impact of our biases on the curriculum guide, international committees of historians, literary scholars, and educators, reviewed the package at different stages in its development. We do not expect all teachers and students to share our conclusions. Hopefully the documents will enable people to discuss alternative explanations and reach their own conclusions.

Significance of Religion

The United States has a long and valued tradition of a "wall of separation" between Church and State. This tradition, and the laws that support it, protects religious beliefs and church organizations from government

regulations that might be used to stifle religious practice. They also prevent powerful religious groups from determining government policies, gaining unfair advantages, or stigmatizing families who choose not to believe.

In public education, the wall of separation has been redefined over the years. It now means that public schools cannot sponsor Bible readings or prayers and cannot present one set of religious beliefs as a norm that every moral person should follow. However, while public schools cannot teach religion, teachers are free to, and in some cases expected to, teach about religion.

Because of the importance of the wall of separation, many public school teachers hesitate to teach about religion. They fear that adherents to these beliefs might feel they are being presented incorrectly, or that people from other religious backgrounds, or people who reject all religions, will object to what their children are being taught. This presents a dilemma when teaching about Ireland and the Great Irish Famine, because the history and culture of Ireland cannot be separated easily from the religious beliefs of the people of Ireland. In many parts of the world, the mid-nineteenth century was a profoundly religious era when people were concerned about their salvation and that of others. While their beliefs were genuinely held, occasionally their zeal led them to adopt attitudes that today would be regarded as evidence of bigotry and religious prejudice.

We have tried to address these issues in the Great Irish Famine Curriculum Guide in two ways. First, we acknowledge the complexity of the matter of religion in famine historiography and address that complexity in our examination of the way Irish of different religious traditions responded to the famine crisis. Roman Catholic institutions, leaders, and practices played a major role in the daily life of most Irish, in resistance to British colonialism, and in providing support during the famine years. Customs, oral traditions and folk arts reflect religious heritage. Rather than ignoring important aspects of Irish culture and history, we think the role of religion in Irish life should be examined. Students on all grade levels can use an examination of religion in Irish life to help them explore the role of religion in human history and why groups of people have often expressed their most fundamental values and beliefs through religion.

Second, the Great Irish Famine Curriculum Guide does not demonize Protestants as proselytizers. It pays tribute to rescuers from all religious denominations who aided in relief efforts. Some Protestant denominations, especially the Quakers, played a crucial role in providing famine relief. While the authors believe that anti-Catholic prejudice played a major role in justifying injustice, lessons encourage students to explore the role of religious and cultural prejudice in the joint history of Ireland and Great Britain and to draw their own conclusions.

Validity of Sources

The historical reliability of some of the material presented in this curriculum guide has been challenged, either because of its point of view, or because of its clouded origins. Instead of removing these documents, we want teachers and students, acting as historians, to evaluate their validity and historical significance. For example, John Mitchel and Charles Trevelyan are political leaders who are either attacking or defending British government policies. Readers must take that into account when evaluating their explanation of events. Newspaper accounts also contain political and social biases.

The authenticity of some famine journals have been challenged. Critics question whether Gerald Keegan's diary, first published in 1895, is an actual historical account or a work of fiction. Because of the intensity of debate surrounding the Keegan diary, and because other, better established, primary source documents are available for examination, we decided not to include excerpts from the Keegan diary.

Global Perspective

In designing the Great Irish Famine Curriculum Guide, we decided that a narrow focus on the events between 1845 and 1852 did a disservice to history, students, and the victims of the Great Hunger. We have tried to place events in a broad global context, while developing lesson material that fits into the New York State 9th and 10th grade Global History calendar and can be used in Language Arts and Literature and Arts education classes.

The historical narrative begins with the origins of Ireland and the Irish and early ties between Ireland and Great Britain. The guide makes it possible to include sections on Ireland in the study of the Columbian Exchange, colonialism, early industrialization, the development of modern economic thought, the growth of 19th century imperialism, 19th century trans-Atlantic migration, the origins of the modern state, United States history, and instances of famine in the world today.

Because of our concerns with examining essential social studies and historical questions, connecting the history of Ireland to other events in the past and present, and exploring themes in the New York State Social Studies Learning Standards, the guide concludes with a section that addresses the United Nations Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide and other human rights issues in global history and the contemporary world.

HIGH SCHOOL LESSON IDEA - Grade Level 10.

AIM QUESTION: Why study about the Great Irish Famine, 1845-1852?

SOCIAL STUDIES STANDARDS:

World History: Students will use a variety of intellectual skills to demonstrate their understanding of major ideas, eras, themes, developments, and turning points in world history, and examine the broad sweep of history from a variety of perspectives.

Geography: Students will use a variety of intellectual skills to demonstrate their understanding of the geography of the interdependent world in which we live -- local, national and global -- including the distribution of people, places and environments over the Earth's surface.

Economics: Students will use a variety of intellectual skills to demonstrate their understanding of how the United States and other societies develop economic systems and associated institutions to allocate scarce resources, how major decision-making units function in the U.S. and other national economies, and how an economy solves the scarcity problem through market and non-market mechanisms.

TEACHER BACKGROUND:

Study of the Great Irish Famine allows students to explore a number of essential social studies questions related to the causes of events and the responsibility of government to respond to them. No one knows exactly how many people died in Ireland's great Famine of 1845-52, but in a population of more than eight million people, the death count reached at least one million. Another million and a half people emigrated. This human disaster occurred within the jurisdiction of Great Britain, the richest and most industrially advanced empire in the world at that time. According to historian Christine Kineally in an article in *Natural History* magazine (January 1998), "the potato blight was an ecological disaster that struck Ireland when it was particularly vulnerable. But what transformed the blight into a famine was the failure of the British government, along with landlords and merchants, to meet the challenge and implement effective action." Conditions in Ireland became so bad during the potato famine that according to one report: "Most of the dead were buried in fields or along the roads. The corpse was frequently wrapped with straw ropes and buried in this way without a coffin. . . . Tombstones were not erected as it was difficult to find men with the strength to make the graves. . . . Bodies actually lay unburied by hedges for rats soon devoured the flesh and only the skeleton remained. During the famine people died from a variety of causes, though relatively few from actual starvation. Most were felled by relapsing fever, typhus, dysentery, and cholera. Their vulnerability to these diseases made worse by hunger, inadequate shelter, overcrowding in workhouses, and hard labor on work relief projects.

ASSESSMENT: Student will be able to demonstrate -

- an understanding of cause and effect in history and the ability to support conclusions based on an evaluation of evidence through individual and group writing assignments and during group and class discussions.
- the importance of examining and respecting multiple perspectives when explaining historical events.
- the ability to examine and explain the significance of primary source documents.
- the ability to apply an understanding of explain contemporary problems to explain historical events.

MATERIAL: Activity sheets are prepared for students on different reading levels. Edited documents are primary sources shortened to highlight key points with some definitions included. Adapted documents translate text into language more accessible to students while retaining main ideas, information and at least some sense of the original language. Rewritten documents are completely rewritten, sacrificing language to make meaning accessible to students. Teachers have

the option of using differentiated edited, adapted and rewritten text, either with an entire class on any grade level or with selected students.

DO NOW ACTIVITY: Read ACTIVITY A: Excerpts from an editorial in *The London Times*, September 22, 1846, section A, and answer questions 1 and 2.

MOTIVATIONAL ACTIVITY: What contemporary natural disasters do you remember? Hurricanes. Droughts. Storms? Floods? Explain. These kinds of events have been called acts of nature. But the impact of acts of nature are often influenced by the actions of people and governments. For example, a heat wave leads to expanded use of electricity, but failure to plan leads to a blackout. In your opinion, are companies and governments responsible for “acts of nature”? Do they have a responsibility to plan to prevent widespread disruption, damage, and death? Do they have a responsibility to assist victims and help them survive and rebuild? Explain.

TRANSITIONAL ACTIVITY: Read ACTIVITY A and answer key questions: What caused the destruction of the Irish potato crop? Who does the editorial blame for the Great Irish Famine? What is the editorials view of the Irish response to action taken by the British government? Who else could be considered responsible? How do we decide who is responsible for the Great Irish Famine? What kind of information would you want to examine to help you decide?

ACTIVITY: Student teams read and discuss ACTIVITY B and answer questions 3, 4, 5. Teams report on their views to the class and the full class discusses key questions: Who does the editorial blame for the hardships in Ireland during the Famine? Why does the editorial blame them? In your opinion, how are these arguments similar to or different from statements made about welfare recipients in our country today? Explain the reason for your answer.

SUMMARY QUESTION: In your opinion, why is it important to study the causes and the impact of the Great Irish Famine?

APPLICATION QUESTIONS: In your opinion, do you think there was anything the Irish could have done to become accepted as equal citizens in Great Britain? Explain. In your opinion, what groups in United States history had similar experiences? Explain. Discuss the contemporary debate over public assistance programs in the United States. What similarities and differences exist with the opinions expressed in this editorial?

HOMEWORK: Act of Nature/Act of Man: Find a Current Events article on a natural disaster in the contemporary world. Summarize the story of the disaster. Explain your opinion on why it can be considered an act of nature, an act of man, or both?

(ACTIVITY SHEET - EDITED VERSION)

A: AN EDITORIAL ON PUBLIC RESPONSE TO THE GREAT IRISH FAMINE. Excerpts from an editorial in *The London Times*, September 22, 1846.

Do Now: Read and answer questions 1 and 2.

Word Bank: calamity - disaster; murmur - whisper; palliate -relieve; afflictions - illnesses.

“The people have made up their minds to report the worst and believe the worst. Human agency is now denounced as instrumental in adding to the calamity inflicted by Heaven. It is no longer submission to Providence, but a murmur against the Government. The potatoes were blighted by a decree from on high. Such are the thanks that a Government gets for attempting to palliate great afflictions.”

Questions

1- Who does the editorial blame for the Great Irish Famine?

2- What is the editorials view of the Irish response to action taken by the English government?

B: Read section B, C and D and answer questions 3, 4 and 5.

Word Bank: indolence - laziness; suffrage - voting; doles - welfare benefits; bonbons- chocolate candy; Irish; potatophagi - potato lovers; dun - bill.	Celts -
--	---------

B) The Government provided work for a people who love it not. It made this the absolute condition of relief. The Government was required to ward off starvation, not to pamper indolence; its duty was to encourage industry, not to stifle it; to stimulate others to give employment, not to outbid them, or drive them from the labor markets. Alas! the Irish peasant had tasted of famine and found that it was good.

C) There are ingredients in the Irish character which must be modified and corrected before either individuals or Government can hope to raise the general condition of the people. It is absurd to prescribe political innovations for the remedy of their sufferings or the alleviations of their wants. Extended suffrage and municipal reform for a peasantry who have for six centuries consented to alternate between starvation on a potato and the doles of national charity! You might as well give them bonbons.

D) For our own parts, we regard the potato blight as a blessing. When the Celts once cease to be potatophagi, they must become carnivorous. With the taste of meats will grow the appetite for them. With this will come steadiness, regularity, and perseverance. Nothing will strike so deadly a blow, not only at the dignity of Irish character, but also the elements of Irish prosperity, as a confederacy of rich proprietors to dun the national Treasury.

Questions

3- Who does the editorial blame for the hardships in Ireland during the Famine?

4- Why does the editorial blame them?

5- In your opinion, how are these arguments similar to or different from statements made about welfare recipients in our country today? Explain the reason for your answer.

(ACTIVITY SHEET - ADAPTED VERSION)

A: AN EDITORIAL ON PUBLIC RESPONSE TO THE GREAT IRISH FAMINE. Based on an editorial in *The London Times*, September 22, 1846.

Do Now: Read and answer questions 1 and 2.

The people have made up their minds to report the worst and believe the worst.

Human actions are now blamed as responsible for adding to the disaster caused by Heaven. It is no longer submission to Providence, but a complaint against the Government. The potatoes were blighted by a decree from on high. Such are the thanks that a Government gets for attempting to relieve great suffering.

Questions

1- Who does the editorial blame for the Great Irish Famine?

2- What is the editorials view of the Irish response to action taken by the English government?

B: Read section B, C and D and answer questions 3, 4 and 5.

B) The Government provided work for a people who love it not. It made this the absolute condition of relief. The Government was required to ward off starvation, not to reward laziness; its duty was to encourage industry, not to stifle it; to stimulate others to give employment, not to outbid them, or drive them from the labor markets. Alas! the Irish peasant had tasted of famine and found that it was good.

C) There are ingredients in the Irish character which must be modified and corrected before either individuals or Government can hope to raise the general condition of the people. It is absurd to prescribe political solutions for the remedy of their sufferings or the lessening of their wants. Extended voting and municipal reform for a peasantry who have for six centuries consented to

alternate between starvation on a potato and national charity! You might as well give them chocolate candies.

D) For our own parts, we regard the potato blight as a blessing. When the Irish once cease to be potato lovers, they must become meat eaters. With the taste of meats will grow the appetite for them. With this will come steadiness, regularity, and persistence. Nothing will strike so deadly a blow, not only at the dignity of Irish character, but also the elements of Irish prosperity, as a group of rich landlords billing the national Treasury.

Questions

3- Who does the editorial blame for the hardships in Ireland during the Famine?

4- Why does the editorial blame them?

5- In your opinion, how are these arguments similar to or different from statements made about welfare recipients in our country today? Explain the reason for your answer.

(ACTIVITY SHEET - REWRITTEN VERSION)

A: AN EDITORIAL ON PUBLIC RESPONSE TO THE GREAT IRISH FAMINE. Based on an editorial in *The London Times*, September 22, 1846.

Do Now: Read and answer questions 1 and 2.

The Irish people report the worst and believe the worst. England is blamed for making a disaster caused by Heaven even worse. Instead of accepting that the potato blight was an act of God, the Irish complain about the government. The potatoes were destroyed by a decree from on high. Such are the thanks that the government gets for attempting to relieve great suffering.

Questions

1- Who does the editorial blame for the Great Irish Famine?

2- What is the editorials view of the Irish response to action taken by the English government?

B: Read section B, C, and D and answer questions 3, 4 and 5.

B) The English government provided work for a people who love it not. It made this the condition of help . The government was required to prevent starvation, not to reward laziness. Its duty was to encourage the growth of industry in Ireland, not to prevent it. Its task was to stimulate others to give people jobs, not to outbid them, or drive them from the labor markets. The problem is that the Irish peasant tasted famine and found that it was good.

C) There are ingredients in the Irish character which must be changed and corrected before either individuals or government can hope to raise the general condition of the people. It is ridiculous to try political solutions for ending sufferings or decreasing the desires of the Irish people. How will voting and reform help peasants who for six centuries alternated between starvation on a potato and national charity? The government might as well give them chocolate candies.

D) This newspaper believes the potato blight was a blessing. When the Irish stop depending on the potato, they must become meat eaters. With the taste of meats will grow their appetite for them. With this will come steadiness, regularity, and persistence. Nothing will strike so deadly a blow at the dignity of Irish character and prosperity as allowing rich landlords to charge the national Treasury for relief programs.

Questions

3- Who does the editorial blame for the hardships in Ireland during the Famine?

4- Why does the editorial blame them?

5- In your opinion, how are these arguments similar to or different from statements made about welfare recipients in our country today? Explain the reason for your answer.

“Destitution in Ireland - failure of the potato crop”. *The Pictorial Times*, August 22, 1846.

Courtesy of National Library of Ireland print collection.